Teaching Care Ethics for the Use of Artificial Intelligence in Education: Thought Experiments and Deep Discourse

AI Opportunities:
- Expanded access to teaching materials.
- Ideas for differentiating lesson plans.
- Efficiencies that save time for 1:1 support for students.
- Support for student content creation.

AI Challenges:
- Materials and information not verified for accuracy.
- Teachers not using extra time for 1:1 student support.
- Atrophy of individual creative thought.

Classical Ethics & AI Use:
AI use is justifiable when…
- **Virtue Ethics**
  …the AI user displays fairness, prudence, self-control, and moderation.
- **Duty Ethics**
  …the AI user is focused on serving others and does not view the consumer as the means to an end.
- **Utilitarian Ethics**
  …the net outcomes of AI use are positive.
- **Pragmatic Ethics**
  …the user is transparent about their AI use and takes full accountability for content created.

Ethics Thought Experiments:
- Two P-12 math teachers. One is a utilitarian who finds satisfaction from her students' academic outcomes. This teacher uses AI to create all her lesson plans, leaving more 1:1 time with students. The other is a virtue ethics teacher who values truth and has found multiple errors in the AI-generated lesson plans. The utilitarian stated that her students' academic outcomes have improved, and the errors are a small price to pay for the extra 1:1 time with students.
  - The dilemma: support AI-use in lesson plans as is to free up more 1:1 time with students, or require time-consuming AI fact-checking that eliminates 1:1 time with students?
- The student handbook of a P-12 school is entered into AI. When incidents occur, AI keeps track of discipline data and determines consequences for students. This streamlines work for the Dean and is "fair" because consequences are predictable. Student #1 has been repeatedly bullied. A fight breaks out in the locker room between Student #1 and his aggressors. The AI student management system determines that both students should be suspended.
  - The dilemma: accept AI's fair and consistent discipline consequence or reject it for a consequence that is tailored to the individual circumstances?

The exercise of each classical system of ethics can cause harm to students. Any harm to students is unacceptable.

Tenets of Care Ethics & AI Use:
AI use is justified when…
1. …the user is focused on creating for the well-being of one or more individuals.
2. …the consumer has some need met by the user's AI use.
3. …there is dialogue and agreement between the user and consumer about the need for AI use.
4. …the user does not intend harm when using AI and there is no harm caused by AI use.

Care Ethics & the Experiments:
- The utilitarian teacher's current AI use is not justified. It violates the 4th tenet.
- The AI student management system is not justified. It violates tenets 2-4.

Tradeoffs with Care Ethics in AI Use:
- Care ethics encourage restraint in AI use.
- Restraint means passing on some benefits of AI use.
- Harm is reduced to the individual.
- Tenets 1-4 do not conflict with other ethical systems.

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHERN INDIANA®

Presented by: Dr. Timothy Mattison

Dr. Elizabeth Wilkins